Intelligent Information System Supporting Observation, Searching and Detection for Security of Citizens in Urban Environment

European Seventh Framework Programme
FP7-218086-Collaborative Project

D0.5 INDECT – Ethical Issues – 2009

The INDECT Consortium

AGH – University of Science and Technology, AGH, Poland
Gdansk University of Technology, GUT, Poland
InnoTec DATA GmbH & Co. KG, INNOTEC, Germany
Grenoble INP (Ensimag), INP, France
MSWiA[1] - General Headquarters of Police (Polish Police), GHP, Poland
Moviquity, MOVIQUITY, Spain
PSI Transcom GmbH, PSI, Germany
Police Service of Northern Ireland, PSNI, United Kingdom
Poznan University of Technology, PUT, Poland
Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, UC3M, Spain
Technical University of Sofia, TU-SOFIA, Bulgaria
University of Wuppertal, BUW, Germany
University of York, UoY, Great Britain
Technical University of Ostrava, VSB, Czech Republic
Technical University of Kosice, TUKE, Slovakia
X-Art Pro Division G.m.b.H., X-art, Austria
Fachhochschule Technikum Wien, FHTW, Austria

© Copyright 2010, the Members of the INDECT Consortium

[1]MSWiA (Ministerstwo Spraw Wewnętrznych i Administracji) – Ministry of Interior Affairs and Administration. Polish Police is dependent on the Ministry

Document Information

Contract Number	*218086*
Deliverable name	*INDECT – Ethical Issues – 2009*
Deliverable number	*D0.5*
Editor(s)	*Jan Derkacz, AGH -UST* *derkacz@kt.agh.edu.pl* *Mikołaj Leszczuk, AGH-UST* *leszczuk@agh.edu.pl*
Author(s)	*Andrzej Dziech, Jan Derkacz,* *Drew Harris, Mikołaj Leszczuk,* *Helen Petrie, Emil Plywaczewski,* *Andreas Pongratz, Ralph Roche,* *Zulema Rosborough, Plamen Vichev,* *Mariusz Ziolko*
Reviewer(s)	*Jacek Danda, AGH-UST*
Dissemination level	*Public*
Contractual date of delivery	*31 August 2010*
Delivery date	*17 August 2010*
Status	*Final version*
Keywords	*Ethics Board, ethical issues*

This project is funded under 7th Framework Program

Table of Contents

1 Executive Summary 5
2 Introduction 6
3 Actions undertaken during the first year of the project 7
4 INDECT approach to Ethical Issues 11
4.1 Main Objectives of INDECT Project 11
4.1.1 Platform for Registration and Exchange of Operational Data 11
4.1.2 Prototype of Integrated Network-Centric System 11
4.1.3 New Type of Search Engine 12
4.2 Dual-Use 12
4.2.1 Potential users of INDECT tools 12
4.2.2 Handling of Collected Personal Data 12
5 INDECT Ethical Issues 14
6 Compliance of INDECT work with Ethical Rules 17
7 Conclusions 18
Annex 1 19
Annex 2 21
Annex 3 23
Annex 4 25
Annex 5 27
Document Updates 30

(This page is left blank intentionally)

1 Executive Summary

The document has for objective to give an overview of activities relevant to ethical issues undertaken within INDECT during the first year of project work. General rules of operation, role of INDECT Ethics Board and its objectives were defined. First candidates for the EB Members were proposed. A number of EU directives as well as regulations respective to specific countries were addressed in the Ethics Board work. A preliminary version of a description presenting INDECT approach to Ethical Issues was prepared.

Work plan for managing Ethical Issues was elaborated at Ethics Board meeting held on 19th November 2009 in Belfast. Actions that were considered by Ethics Board and INDECT Partners during the first year of the project were discussed.

Main objectives of INDECT with respect to citizens' privacy and human rights were addressed as a set of answers to questions and comments received from media, EU citizens and public institutions, such as EU Parliament.

2 Introduction

Security of citizens is one of the most important priorities of EU. This fact has been emphasized in the Fourth European Security Research Conference in Stockholm, 29th-30th September, 2009. For EU FP7 Research Programme, Security call has been announced in 2007.

INDECT project has been initiated by the Polish Platform for Homeland Security (http://www.ppbw.pl/en/index.html). The Project proposal was submitted by the international, pan-European consortium of 17 partners, led by the AGH University of Science and Technology (Krakow, Poland), under the supervision of Professor Andrzej Dziech, the INDECT Project Coordinator. The consortium consists of 11 well-known universities, 4 companies and 2 end-users (Police Service of Northern Ireland and Polish General Headquarters of Police). **It should be underlined that the INDECT project is a research project**, allowing involved European scientists to develop new, advanced and innovative algorithms and methods aiming at combating terrorism and other criminal activities, affecting citizens' safety.

The INDECT project is a standard Seventh Framework Programme (FP7) research project. The project is financed under the Security Theme of FP7. The legal basis of the Security Theme is Council Decision 2006/971/EC[2]. The INDECT project started on the first of January 2009 for duration of 60 months.

[2] 2006/971/EC: Council Decision of 19 December 2006 concerning the Specific Programme Cooperation implementing the seventh framework programme of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities (2007-13), OJ L 400, 30.12.2006.

3 Actions undertaken during the first year of the project

General rules of operation, role of Ethics Board and its objectives were defined in February 2009. First candidates for the EB Members were proposed.

The initial list of EB Members was as follows:

#	Name	Partner	Background
1 (EIM)	Drew Harris	PSNI	Police
2	Zulema Rosborough	PSNI	Police
3	Ralph Roche	PSNI	Police
4	Plamen Vichev	TU-Sofia	Academia
5	Henryk Tusiński	GHP	Police
6	Helen Petrie	UoY	Academia
7	Andreas Pongratz	X-art	Industry
8	Mariusz Ziółko	AGH	Academia
9	Emil Pływaczewski	External	Academia

First Ethics Board meeting was held in Poznan in June 2009. Meeting Agenda comprised the following subjects:

- Indication of the Ethics Board objectives with respect to INDECT scope [INDECT Coordinator]
- Each organisation involved in Ethics Board presented its view on their role in EB [All involved partners]
- Definition of general guidelines for Ethics Board was done [Ethical Issues Manager - Mr. Drew Harris]
- Agenda for the tasks to be done for the next meeting with respect to specific INDECT Work Packages was defined
- Allocation of WPs to EB members was assigned
- Regulations concerning Ethical Issues were identified

At the first Ethics Board meeting Prof. A. Dziech (INDECT Coordinator) has made a presentation briefly addressing a number of EU directives and legislation, stating that INDECT project would not conflict with these. Mr. Drew Harris (Ethical Issues Manager) commissioned a research into these listed directives and legislation. From this, a questionnaire has been created that Mr. Drew Harris proposed to forward to each Workpackage Leader for completion and return to the Ethics Board. The information on the completion of the questionnaire will be used to inform the Ethical Board of any issues that need to be addressed by it.

First INDECT Deliverables were circulated to all Ethics Board members for review and comments.

INDECT – Ethics information was placed on the project web page. The content of the information refers to the following issues:

- INDECT's main objective is to contribute, through technology and innovation, to security of European citizens
- Ethics Board role and objectives
- INDECT is re-utilizing the already available information sources (like: existing cameras, Web Pages)
- Elaborated tools will lower the level of subjective assessment and the number of human mistakes
- Implementation of INDECT outcomes will result in less opportunities for illegitimate use of the monitoring records
- No 'mass surveillance' is intended - only for cases where justified reasons for interference exist
- Use case scenarios considered within project focus on particular crime categories that the society is sensitive to
- INDECT outcomes will make the stored and transferred information safer from unauthorized use
- It is under responsibility of regulatory and law enforcement bodies to define rules and use INDECT tools

A preliminary version of a flyer presenting INDECT approach to Ethical Issues was prepared. It was suggested to make a short presentation of all EB members (picture with a brief profile of each person, their responsibilities in the Ethics Board together with contact details).The aim of this presentation is to have some transparency in the activities of the EB and make it less abstract for all project partners. Details need to be confirmed at the nearest EB meeting.
Based on the comments from INDECT Partners the following actions/approaches should be considered by Ethics Board in the near future:

- It should be underlined that the main project objectives are to increase both, **security and privacy** of persons being in the range of monitoring systems. This is performed on the way of registration and storage of ONLY such situations which are related to a threat to security instead of collecting ALL monitored situations. Monitoring systems are installed in large scale anyway.
- To avoid ambiguity in giving not consistent answers by different persons it could be considered to assign one person for contacts with media.

Regulations respective to specific countries should be taken into account in the project. An example can be France. As notified by Prof. Duda (Grenoble INP – Ensimag, LIG Lab) France has a strict law on the creation of files containing personal information. According to this law, nobody can create a file with personal data even if the data themselves are public.
Even the police needs a specific law that authorizes creation of a file with personal details. Last year, a proposal to create Edwige, a file containing ethnical origin of some persons and their trade union membership, failed under the pressure of the public opinion. Recently, a decree has passed permitting the creation of such a file, but without the controversial details. Obviously, the law applies to collecting personal data in France, but as INDECT is an European project, it needs to conform to the law. To prevent possible violations of the French law, checking whether INDECT activities conform to the French law would be useful.

The current information on ethical issues mainly focuses on security and protection of civil rights. Ethics Board intends to put more stress on problems related to monitoring the Internet. Providing more detailed information on this aspect could help alleviating the misunderstanding from the journalists side.

More detailed work plan for managing Ethical Issues was elaborated at Ethics Board meeting held on 19th November 2009 in Belfast.

Possible Actions that were considered by Ethics Board and INDECT Partners during the first year of the project:

- Addressing Ethical Issues in INDECT Deliverables and Dissemination Activities
- Cooperation with other projects (DETECTER)
- Special Session at INDECT Conferences/Workshops. In particular a dedicated session on Ethical Issues in Police Operations was scheduled for MCSS 2010 (Multimedia Communications, Services and Security) with participation of invited guests involved in research on ethics and human rights.
- Common 'Framework' for reacting to external questions/publications
- Providing exemplary scenarios showing expected positive impact of INDECT on enhancing security of citizens and protecting their privacy
- More frequent Ethics Board meetings

Mr Jan Derkacz presented to members a summary of actions that been transacted following from the previous meeting, thanking Mr Ralph Roche for all of his assistance during this period.

After that a wide ranging discussion on matters of procedure and administration followed.

A short presentation followed with respect to the DETECTER project. An invitation had been extended to the INDECT project to deliver one 20-30 minute presentation during the meeting of the DETECTER project scheduled to take place on 19th February 2010 in Florence.

It was agreed that:

- The invitation has been accepted,
- It should be combined with the next meeting of the Ethics Board,
- It would be necessary to maintain a watching brief on DETECTER and monitor progress in the establishment of standards.

With the aim of ensuring the continued efficiency and effectiveness of the Ethics Board it was decided to:

- Increase the number of Ethics Board meetings from one to four and acknowledging the financial provision within the project this could be undertaken as two face to face meetings supplemented by two via videoconferencing meetings,
- Draft guidance for work package leaders on ethical issues,
- Consider how the Ethical Board could engage with the work package leaders,
- Request all Work Package Leaders to provide:
    - A statement of ethical issues in association with deliverables that Ethics Board members could focus on. This should be prepared for the first round of deliverables,
    - Deliverable 1.1 should be delayed pending consideration of the ethical issues,
    - An executive summary of each deliverable.
- Request that Work Package Leaders ensure members of the Ethics Board have a minimum of two weeks to review elaborated materials,
- All Deliverables to be copied to the generic Ethics Board email account,
- Allocate two members of the Ethics Board to oversee the work of each work package.

In addressing the issue of public disclosure, as presently deliverables do not indicate any level of disclosure, it was agreed that:

- No issues that could impact negatively upon
    - Law enforcement capability
    - National Security
    - Public Safety
    - Organisational Reputation

  should be published in the public domain
- Summary documents of such deliverables should not be published,
- The Ethics Board should decide which deliverables are allowed to be published in the public domain,
- Any principles applied to deliverables should be applied to academic papers,
- Work Package Leaders should initially propose a level of disclosure that will be reviewed by the Ethics Board members overseeing the Work Package.

In general the statement of ethical issues in association with deliverables that members would review focus on:

- The executive summary of each deliverable,
- The proposed disclosure level.

All reports should be issued to the appropriate Ethics Board members as soon as possible and not wait until the drafting of the deliverable is complete.

4 INDECT approach to Ethical Issues

This section discusses the main objectives of the INDECT project as well as its eventual dual use issues.

4.1 Main Objectives of INDECT Project

The main objectives of the INDECT are as follows:

- to develop a platform for: the registration and exchange of operational data, acquisition of multimedia content, intelligent processing of all information and automatic detection of threats and recognition of criminal behaviour or violence,
- to develop the prototype of an integrated, network-centric system supporting the operational activities of police officers, providing techniques and tools for observation of various mobile objects,
- to develop a new type of search engine combining the direct search of images and video based on watermarked contents, and the storage of metadata in the form of digital watermarks.

Detailed information on the INDECT project objectives is available on the project website: http://www.indect-project.eu and on the website of the FP7 research theme: http://cordis.europa.eu/fp7/security/fp7 -project-leaflets_en.html.

4.1.1 Platform for Registration and Exchange of Operational Data

One of the aims of INDECT is to develop a platform for: the registration and exchange of operational data, acquisition of multimedia content, intelligent processing of all information and automatic detection of terroristic threats and recognition of serious criminal behaviour or violence. New techniques for intelligent analysis of data will allow recognizing such situations, and giving alert before it is too late. The objective is also to recognise danger events that could lead to terrorist attacks (e.g. left luggage at an airport, automatic recognition of dangerous tools). The definitions of situations and their parameters is being provided by police departments.

The INDECT project aims at improving the operational efficiency of the law enforcement services, by providing novel technical assistance. In this case: the INDECT project is to develop a platform for the registration and exchange of operational data, including the recognition of criminal behaviour or violence, and to develop a prototype of an integrated, network-centric system supporting the operational activities of police officers.

4.1.2 Prototype of Integrated Network-Centric System

The project supports creation of linked, unmanned planes (UAVs, drones). Their use is not permitted in many regions of Europe among other things because of the lack of compatibility with air traffic control systems. Anyway, the INDECT project is a research project. Research projects address future technologies for which legislation does not exist yet, for its use beyond experimental purposes.

4.1.3 New Type of Search Engine

Another INDECT Project objective is to develop a new type of search engine combining direct **search** of images and video based on **watermarked** contents, and the storage of metadata in the form of digital watermarks. New methods and algorithms for designed search engine, will save precious time for the police officers, to detect the targets (e.g. **serious criminals**, **hackers**). Watermarking of contents will increase **data protection** and **privacy in the Internet**. Special **cryptographic** methods will keep all the data protected against **unauthorized access**.

The INDECT Project is **exceptionally oriented to avoid terrorism and serious criminal actions, also in Internet (e.g. paedophilia, child pornography) to increase security of citizens**. The INDECT consortium will produce the tools for protection of personal data (using watermarking technology) as well. Nevertheless, it was never planned to get observation tools for general purposes.

4.2 Dual-Use

This subsection discuss potential users of INDECT tools as well as issues related to handling of collected personal data.

4.2.1 Potential users of INDECT tools

The main end-user of INDECT solutions are **police forces**. Consequently, there is no direct way of private, dual-use of INDECT solutions (including i.e. digital watermarking). Nevertheless, this is technologically possible, and if ever happens – only outside the INDECT Project framework.

It is also possible for private businesses **to make website activity or CCTV feeds available to INDECT**; however, on **voluntary**, rather than not obligatory basis. The exception is a situation when local, legal regulations impose private business (e.g. telecom operator) to disclose some data. It should be noted that data disclosure has to be limited **by human rights**, and voluntary acts have to be guaranteed **on informed consent forms** signed by persons whose data is being disclosed.

4.2.2 Handling of Collected Personal Data

Handling of collected personal data while protecting privacy and confidentiality is of major importance for the project; a specific task monitors on this aspect throughout the project. The project is actively seeking to keep browsing habits private per se; however, this cannot be reason to flag someone for further investigation. Anyway, profiling **suspected** figureheads, even with anonymous identities, protected by using special software (like TOR), is expected. It should be stressed here again that one of the INDECT Project objectives is to develop a set of techniques supporting analysis of the acquired information, and detection of **serious criminal activities** and **threats (paedophilia, child pornography)**.

The main target of INDECT solutions is crime prevention instead of crime prosecution. However, in case of situation where crime already happened, the project will develop

necessary tools which will help **Police Services** to detect **terrorism**, **serious crime** and **offenders** quickly and efficiently. **Current, manual methods will be replaced by innovative, automatic technologies – still being in line with all national and EU legal regulations.** In addition, the high security for information flow needed by police and prosecutor offices will be offered. This objective will be reached by designing and prototyping the method of software assistance support for secure searching of required persons and documents, including any security activities of police and prosecutors.

INDECT researchers do not hold and do not intend to hold **data normally requiring a warrant or court order**. INDECT is a research project elaborating tools for data processing and analysis. For research purposes a fictional data is sufficient. The research activities in INDECT are based only on public information or on non-public; computer generated **virtual or training data**. Finally, the INDECT systems do not collect directly any classified data. Nevertheless, protection is ensured for all the possessed data in case of some of them to get classified in a future, after the results of data processing.

5 INDECT Ethical Issues

The **INDECT** project has to address a number of ethical issues because of its nature, where information is processed in many different ways, from security video feeds to intelligent multimedia content analysis in **Web** server information storage and processing. The INDECT Consortium has already presented to the European Commission general assumptions about ethics related issues in the original project proposal. In this document the INDECT consortium provides additional information to addresses the issues identified by INDECT reviewers. The project identifies the following ethical issues: adults, informed consent, privacy, data protection and dual use.

The INDECT project has been subject to a European Commission's Ethics Review. The ethics review panel has concluded that, following the adoption of the review requirements, the research work is in full compliance with legal rules and obligations to be observed by the EU and by its Member States. Amongst others, the requirements included the establishment of a project Ethics Board that reports to the Commission on potential improper use of research results.

This requires *inter alia* that Article 8 of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights be complied with, which gives everyone the right to the protection of their own personal data. If personal data are processed then this must be done fairly, for specified purposes and on the basis of the consent of the person concerned or some other legitimate basis laid down by law, and must in particular be necessary and proportionate. Furthermore, everyone has the right to access personal data that has been collected, and the right to have it rectified. Compliance with these rules is subject to control by an independent authority.

INDECT applies a set of rules related to ethical issues. There are two separate entities, the Ethical Issues Manager and the Ethics Board that take care for the rules related to ethical issues addressed by INDECT.

The **Ethical Issues Manager (EIM)** ensures strict fulfilment of the ethical rules set to deal with privacy, data protection, prevent dual use and guarantee informed consent of users in the project. He is responsible for managing and monitoring ethical aspects through the duration of the project, including the promotion of gender equality in the project. Another task is overseeing science and society issues, related to the research activities conducted within the project.

The **INDECT Project Coordinator (PC)** designated an **Ethics Board (EB)** which was accepted by **Project Board**. **Ethics Board** supervise the ethical aspects of the activities carried out by the different **WPs** will analyse and will propose solutions to the **PB** to cope with all the **Ethical Issues** faced by the project. The **Ethics Board** ensures strict fulfilment of the ethical rules set to deal with privacy, data protection, prevent dual use and guarantee informed consent of users in the project.

The **Ethics Board** has been established to report to the Project Board and **inform the Commission of ethical issues**. This **Board** supports the project consortium in examining the societal, political and legal aspects of potential applications, especially dual-use applications, defines and approves the future exploitation plans of the project results, and controls dissemination and communication strategy of research results to a wider audience. A **trial system** could be **implemented** only in case when it would be fully validated.

The responsibilities of the **Ethics Board** include:
- Tracing the current legal acts being published during the project realization,
- Tailoring the solutions being developed to the new legal acts,
- Establishing the ethical control procedures, which must be followed before performing tests with human subjects,
- Consulting the developed solutions with the national entities responsible for ethical issues, especially in area of both people and Internet monitoring,
- Organization (at least once per year) of meetings devoted to all uncertain questions related to ethical issues with participation of competent entities dealing with this problem, and
- Permanent monitoring of proposed solutions in the INDECT project with regard to the ethical issues.

Ethics Board analyses and proposes solutions to cope with all the Ethical Issues faced by the project. Problems and relevant solutions are discussed during "physical" Ethics Board meetings, via e-mails, teleconferences based on exchange of opinions with researchers from different Work Packages.

The members of the Project INDECT Ethics Board are:
- Two police officers and one retired police officer
- A human rights lawyer
- Professor specializing in Ethics in Scientific Research
- A technical specialist
- Three researchers in the domain of security related technologies

Ethics Board members were appointed from INDECT partnership accordingly to their expertise and approved by Project Coordinator. Activities and decisions performed by Ethics Board members require specific expertise and experience in the field of Security and Ethical Issues. A student's representative or representatives – volunteers – can have status of "observer" of Ethics Board activities. Their suggestions and comments are considered by Ethics Board members.

The composition of the INDECT Project Ethics Board is broad and it is designed to exert strict control over the project. Given that the results of the project are for law enforcement purposes, participation of police is of great importance.

Recognizing its importance, to further enhance the Project Ethics Board, the project added independent experts. These experts have proven expertise in ethical and data protection issues.

Ethics Board supervises the work In the Project to be conformant to the following regulations:
- European Convention on Human Rights:
    - ECHR Article 2 – right to life
    - ECHR Article 3 – right to freedom from torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment
    - ECHR Article 5 – right to liberty and security
    - ECHR Article 6 – right to a fair trial
    - ECHR Article 8 – right to respect for home, private and family life and correspondence
    - ECHR Article 9 – freedom of thought conscience and religion

  - ECHR Article 10 – freedom of expression, and
  - ECHR Article 11 – freedom of assembly and association
- European Union Charter of Fundamental Freedoms:
  - Article 8
- UN Convention on The Rights of the Child:
  - Article 3 – the best interests of child

All projects funded under FP7, including INDECT, are bound to comply with strict criteria in the processing of personal data, with Article 7 of Directive 95/46/EC[3] being the appropriate legal basis. It remains the responsibility of the authorities of the Member States to use these new technologies, taking into account the right of citizens to the protection of personal data. Should Member States intend to use such new technologies within the scope of Union law, they are bound to comply with EU fundamental rights as enshrined in the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, as well as the European Convention on Human Rights, and to address the processing of personal data on a proper legal basis.

Citizens are in principle not affected by the INDECT project. Should personal data of citizens be used during the project, then — as for all FP7 funded projects — it is bound to comply with strict criteria in the processing of personal data, with Article 7 of Directive 95/46/EC being the appropriate legal basis. The INDECT project has been subject to a scrutiny to ensure compatibility with criteria for the processing of personal data (the appropriate legal basis being Article 7 of Directive 1995/46/EC)[4].

[3] Directive 95/46/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 24 October 1995 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data and on the free movement of such data, OJ L 281, 23.11.1995.

[4] Ref. source: http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getAllAnswers.do?reference=E-2010-1385&language=EN

6 Compliance of INDECT work with Ethical Rules

INDECT project obeys rules concerning ethics and protection of personal data.

INDECT project was a subject to inspection carried out by Polish General Inspector of Personal Data (pol. *Główny Inspektor Danych Osobowych* – GIODO). Following the inspection a letter was issued by the Office of GIODO signed by The Director of Inspection Department, Mrs Bogusława Pilc. The letter states that the inspection that was performed at AGH-UST had for the scope compliance with regulations concerning protection of personal data (law from 29th August 1997 on Protection of Personal Data) and regulation of the Minister of Interior Affairs and Administration, dated to 29th April 2004 with respect to processing of personal data and technical and organisational conditions that equipment and information systems used to process personal data should be conformant to.

It testifies that processing of personal data within INDECT project that at current phase of the project no personal data is being processed (apart from these of project authors). The inspection ascertained that at further phase it is foreseen that real personal data can be used for the purpose of tests. Persons whose data will be used will express their consent by filling in relevant questionnaire.

In summary it is confirmed that AGH-UST at current phase of the project realisation does not violate regulations concerning protection of personal data.

Full text of the letter can be found in Annex 1.

For the purpose of testing systems elaborated within INDECT (and another project conducted within AGH-UST) a consent form was prepared. The form was filled in and signed by staff members whose cars were subject to the tests.
The form is attached in Annex 1 of the Deliverable.

Planned usage of data from public places for research purposes is based on agreements and permits received from relevant public entities and citizens. In particular the following permits have been asked for and/or received until now:

- Permissions for the use of video containing shots of the vehicle operated by persons entering the parking of Department of Telecommunications – AGH (see Annex 2)
- Request for permission to mount over the entrance to the building of Department of Telecommunication cameras for monitoring, from which the image will be used for research projects: INDECT and INSIGMA (see Annex 3)
- Permission for carrying out research activities at Poznan-Lawica Airport (see Annex 4)
- Permission granted to GUT for an access to signals from video monitoring systems installed in a few places in Warsaw (see Annex 5)

7 Conclusions

It should be pointed out that information on all projects in the field of security research is publicly available to ensure transparency and public debate. Consequently, upon initiative of the European Commission, the INDECT project was invited to present its findings and discuss them with invited experts on privacy and data protection at the Security Research Conference at the end of September 2009 in Stockholm.

Furthermore, it should be noted that **INDECT is a research project**, not an implementation project. The outcome of the project will be demonstration of prototypes/test-beds, rather that production phase products. Consequently issues related to daily use of INDECT systems are far out of scope of the project framework, possibly to be included in its follow-ups, aimed at exploitation of INDECT results.

Of highest importance for the project is to assure security for the collected and stored data. This results of higher privacy level for persons to whom the data is related. The following techniques are used for this purpose: Digital Water-Marking, Cryptography algorithms.

Key role was assigned to project Ethics Board for assuring required level of privacy during the research and with respect to elaborated tools and methods. Ethics Board analyses and proposes solutions to cope with all the Ethical Issues faced by the project.

INDECT's objective is NOT global monitoring or invigilation as suggested or interpreted by some media or "Internet activists". Most of partners come from academic domain. Their objective is to make innovation and progress in such research areas as digital watermarking, artificial intelligence, image recognition and signal processing. Police partners define and assess the usability of tools and algorithms developed by researchers for fighting crime and terrorism threats.

What is discouraging for persons working in INDECT is that instead of making research a significant amount of the time is consumed for explaining what the project is NOT about.

Annex 1

BIURO
GENERALNEGO INSPEKTORA
OCHRONY DANYCH OSOBOWYCH

Warszawa, dnia 16 lipca 2010 r.

DIS-K-421/86/10/28683

Do wiadomości Katedra Telekomunikacji wydz. EAIiE i pow. prof. A. Dziech

REKTOR Akademii Górniczo-Hutniczej w Krakowie
Prof. dr hab. inż. Antoni Tajduś

Szanowny Panie Profesorze,

Jego Magnificencja
Prof. dr hab. inż. Antoni Tajduś
Rektor Akademii Górniczo – Hutniczej
im. Stanisława Staszica w Krakowie
Al. Mickiewicza 30
30-059 Kraków

W związku z kontrolą przeprowadzoną w Akademii Górniczo – Hutniczej im. Stanisława Staszica w Krakowie z siedzibą w Krakowie przy Al. Mickiewicza 30 w zakresie dotyczącym zgodności z przepisami o ochronie danych osobowych, tj. ustawą z dnia 29 sierpnia 1997 r. o ochronie danych osobowych (Dz. U. z 2002 r., Nr 101, poz. 926 z późn. zm.) oraz rozporządzeniem Ministra Spraw Wewnętrznych i Administracji z dnia 29 kwietnia 2004 r. w sprawie dokumentacji przetwarzania danych osobowych oraz warunków technicznych i organizacyjnych, jakim powinny odpowiadać urządzenia i systemy informatyczne służące do przetwarzania danych osobowych (Dz. U. Nr 100, poz. 1024), przetwarzania danych osobowych w ramach projektu „INDECT – Inteligentny system informacyjny wspierający obserwację, poszukiwanie i detekcję dla bezpieczeństwa obywateli w środowisku miejskim" (dalej: projekt) uprzejmie informuję, że w toku kontroli ustalono, że na obecnym etapie realizacji projektu nie są przetwarzane dane osobowe (poza danymi autorów projektu). Jednocześnie ustalono, że na późniejszym etapie przewidywane jest wykorzystanie prawdziwych danych osobowych do testu systemu. Osoby, których dane zostaną wykorzystane, wyrażą zgodę na to wypełniając stosowny kwestionariusz, którego wzór został opracowany przez Komisję Europejską. Wobec powyższego należy uznać, że Akademia Górniczo – Hutnicza w Krakowie na obecnym etapie realizacji projektu nie narusza przepisów o ochronie danych osobowych.

z wyrazami szacunku

Z up. Generalnego Inspektora
Ochrony Danych Osobowych
Dyrektor Departamentu Inspekcji
Bogusława Pilc

tel. 860-70-93
fax 860-70-90
www.giodo.gov.pl

Sekretariat Rektora AGH
Wpłynęło dnia 2010-07-21
Zarejestrowano pod nr 9472
podpis Nach

OFFICE OF
GENERAL DATA
PROTECTION SUPERVISOR

Warsaw, date: 16 July 2010

His Magnificence
Prof. Dr Hab. Eng. Antoni Tajduś
Rector of Stanislaw Staszic
AGH University of Science and Technology
Al. Mickiewicza 30
30-059 Krakow

In connection with the conducted control provided for the Stanislaw Staszic AGH University of Science and Technology – in Krakow, based in Krakow, Al. Mickiewicza 30 in relation to compliance with data protection, namely the Law of 29 August 1997 on the Protection of Personal Data (Journal of Laws of 2002 No. 101, item. 926, as amended) and Regulation of the Minister of Internal Affairs and Administration 2 of 29 April 2004 on personal data processing documentation and technical and organizational conditions should be fulfilled by devices and systems used for the processing of personal data (Journal of Laws No. 100, item. 1024), the processing of personal data under the project "INDECT – Intelligent information system supporting observation, searching and detection for security of citizens in urban environment" (the project). Please be advised that during an investigation found that at this stage of the project personal data are not processed (in addition to the authors' of the project). At the same time, it was found that at a later stage is expected to use real data to test the system. Persons whose data will be used, agrees that by completing the relevant questionnaire, a model was developed by the European Commission. It must therefore be considered, that the AGH University of Science and Technology in Krakow, at this stage of the project is without prejudice to the protection of personal data.

Sincerely

Bogusława Pelc

Annex 2

Kraków, dnia .....

ZGODA

Wyrażam zgodę na wykorzystanie materiału wideo zawierającego ujęcia użytkowanego przeze mnie pojazdu o następujących cechach:

Marka: .....
Kolor: .....
Numer rejestracyjny: .....

w celach naukowych (w tym również publikację) związanych głównie z projektami „Inteligentny System Informacyjny dla Globalnego Monitoringu, Detekcji i Identyfikacji Zagrożeń" (INSIGMA) oraz „Intelligent information system supporting observation, searching and detection for security of citizens in urban environment" (INDECT).

Widoczne i rozpoznawalne na wyżej wspomnianym materiale wideo są: marka pojazdu, kolor i numer rejestracyjny. Materiał został zarejestrowany przy wjeździe na parking budynku D5 AGH.

.....
.....
Imię i nazwisko właściciela *Podpis*

Krakow, date:.....

Consent,

I agree to the use of video containing shots of the vehicle operated by me with the following characteristics:

Brand: …….
Colour: ……
Registration Number: ……..

for scientific purposes (including publication) primarily related to the projects "Intelligent Information System for Global Monitoring, Detection and Identification of Risks" (INSIGMA) and "Intelligent Information System Supporting observation, searching for security of Citizens in urban environment" (INDECT).

Visible and identifiable to the above-mentioned video, are the brand of vehicle, colour and registration number. It was recorded at the entrance to the parking of building D5 AGH.

First Name and Surname Signature

Annex 3

Wydział Elektrotechniki, Automatyki, Informatyki i Elektroniki

KATEDRA TELEKOMUNIKACJI

KANCLERZ

KT/185/IV / 2010

Kraków, dn. 11.05.2010

Szanowny Pan Kanclerz AGH
mgr inż. Henryk Ziołp
w miejscu

przez Pana Dziekan Wydziału EAIIE
dr hab. inż. Antoniego Cieślę, prof.n.

Szanowny Panie,

Uprzejmie proszę o wyrażenie zgody na zamontowanie nad wejściem do budynku Katedry Telekomunikacji D-5 kamery do monitoringu, z której obraz będzie używany do badań w ramach projektów: INDECT i INSIGMA.

Z wyrazami szacunku,

Prof. dr hab. inż. Andrzej Dziech
Koordynator Projektu INDECT i Kierownik Projektu INSIGMA

DZIEKAN WYDZIAŁU

Dr hab. inż. Antoni Cieśla, prof. n.

KIEROWNIK KATEDRY

prof. dr hab. inż. Andrzej R. Pach

Sekretariat Kanclerza AGH
13 MAJ 2010

Akademia Górniczo-Hutnicza | Wydział Elektrotechniki, Automatyki, Informatyki i Elektroniki
Katedra Telekomunikacji
al. A. Mickiewicza 30, 30-059 Kraków,
tel. +48 12 617 39 37, fax +48 12 634 23 72
e-mail: kt@agh.edu.pl, www.kt.agh.edu.pl

(consent)

Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Automatics, Computer Science and Electronics

DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS

Krakow, date: 11.05.2010

Dear Lord Chancellor AGH
Henryk Zioło, MSc
at

by Mr Dean EAIiE
Prof. Dr Eng. Antoni Cieśla,

Sir,

We kindly ask for permission to mount over the entrance to the building of Department of Telecommunication cameras for monitoring, from which the image will be used for research projects: INDECT and INSIGMA.

Yours sincerely,

Prof. Dr Hab. Eng. Andrzej Dziech
INDECT Project Coordinator and INSIGMA Project Manager

AGH University of Science and Technology | Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Automatics, Computer Science and Electronics
Department of Telecommunication
al. A. Mickiewicza 30, 30-059 Krakow,
tel +48 12 617 39 37, fax +48 12 634 23 72
e-mail: www.kt.agh.edu.pl

Annex 4

Krosno Odrzańskie, 16 lutego 2010r.

Zastępca Komendanta
Nadodrzańskiego Oddziału Straży Granicznej
w Krośnie Odrzańskim

NO-DA/2630/10

Egz. nr 1

Prof. zw. dr hab. inż. Andrzej CZYŻEWSKI

WYDZIAŁ ELEKTRONIKI, TELEKOMUNIKACJI I INFORMATYKI

Politechnika Gdańska
ul. Narutowicza 11/12
80-233 Gdańsk

Szanowny Panie Profesorze,

w związku z pismem skierowanym przez Pana Profesora dotyczącym umożliwienia prowadzenia projektu badawczego w Porcie Lotniczym Poznań-Ławica pt. *„Wykrywanie sytuacji niebezpiecznych z udziałem osób, w tym porzucenia bagażu"* uprzejmie informuję, że Nadodrzański Oddział Straży Granicznej w Krośnie Odrzańskim jest zainteresowany współpracą z Politechniką Gdańską w realizacji przedmiotowego projektu.

Komendant Placówki Straży Granicznej w Poznaniu-Ławicy udzieli podległemu Panu zespołowi wykonawczemu Politechniki Gdańskiej pomocy praktycznej i merytorycznej w realizacji w/w projektu na dotychczas obowiązujących zasadach.

Mając na uwadze brak podstaw formalnych Komendant Nadodrzańskiego Oddziału Straży Granicznej nie może podpisać umowy licencyjnej dołączonej do podania.

W chwili instalacji sprzętu w infrastrukturze i za zgodą Portu Lotniczego Poznań-Ławica, Straż Graniczna nie była informowana o konieczności podpisania w przyszłości umowy licencyjnej.

Z wyrazami szacunku

kpt. SG Waldemar HOŁODNIUK

Wykonano w 2 egz.
Egz. nr 1 – adresat
Egz. nr 2 - a/a
Wyk. B.S., tel. (61) 861 1301
Sporz. M.B., tel. (68) 358 2207

Krosno Odrzanskie, 16th Feb. 2010

To: Prof.dr hab.inż Andrzej Czyżewski
Faculty of Electronics, Telecommunications and Computer Science

GUT
Narutowicza 11/12 Str.
80-233 Gdansk

Dear Professor

Referring to letter sent by you concerning the allowance for carrying out research activities at Poznan-Lawica Airport "Detection of dangerous situations involving persons, including left luggage", I kindly inform you, that the Border Guard in Krosno Odrzanskie is interested to cooperate with GUT during realization of the project.

Commanding Officer of the Board Guard in Poznan-Lawica will provide your team from GUT with practical and specialized help for performing the project based on existing rules.

Taking into account lack of formal regulations Commanding Officer of the Board Guard cannot sign the license agreement attached to the application.

At the time of equipment installation within infrastructure and permission of Poznan-Lawica Airport, the Board Guard was not informed about the necessity to sign license agreement in the future.

Respectfully

Capt. Waldemar HOŁODNIUK

Annex 5

Intelligent Information System Supporting Observation, Searching and Detection for Security of Citizens in Urban Environment

Lb -888 /2010

Warszawa, 2010-06-17

Egz. nr 1.

Prof. dr hab. inż. Andrzej Czyżewski
Kierownik Projektu
Katedra Systemów Multimedialnych
Wydział Elektroniki, Telekomunikacji i Informatyki
Politechnika Gdańska

dot. dostępu do sygnałów wideo z monitoring w ramach projektu INDECT

W nawiązaniu do Pisma Pana Profesora z dnia 12 maja 2010r. uprzejmie informuję, iż Komendant Stołeczny Policji zapewni dostęp Politechnice Gdańskiego do sygnałów z systemów monitoringu na budynku Pałacu Kultury i Nauki oraz z systemu monitoringu Metra Warszawskiego, w zakresie realizowanych prac badawczych w projekcie „Indect". Możliwym będzie wykorzystanie sygnałów z systemów w trybie on-line oraz z systemów archiwizacji obrazu w celu realizacji badań związanych z automatyczną detekcją zagrożeń, które pozwolą na ograniczenie liczny operatorów systemów oraz znacząco poprawią efektywność systemów monitoringu.

Pragnę zaznaczyć, iż prezentacja wyników badań przy wykorzystaniu sygnałów video uzyskanych z ww. systemów będzie możliwa po uzyskaniu akceptacji Właściciela systemu, którą KSP będzie starała się pozyskać.

DYREKTOR
BIURA ŁĄCZNOŚCI I INFORMATYKI
KOMENDY GŁÓWNEJ POLICJI
mł. insp. Radosław CHR[illegible]SKI

Wyk. w 2 egz.
Egz. nr 1 – adresat
Egz. nr 2 – a/a
Sporządził: Katarzyna Wasilewska, tel. 22 60 153 78

To: Professor Andrzej Czyżewski
Project Leader
Department of Multimedia Systems,
Faculty of Electronics, Telecommunications and Computer Science
Gdansk University of Technology

Referring to your letter from 12th May 2010 I kindly inform you, that Chief Commander of Capital Police will allow to GUT an access to signals from systems installed at Palace of Science and Culture and in Warsaw Metro, in the scope of research work performed in INDECT project. It will be possible to use signals from the systems in on-line mode as well as from video archiving systems for the purpose of research related to automatic threats detection, which will allow for decreasing of number of system operators and will improve effectiveness of monitoring systems.

I would like to note that presentation of outcomes of research done with the use of video signals from the above mentioned systems will be possible after acceptance from the Owner of the system, which Headquarters of Capital Police will try to obtain.

Head of CIT Office
General Headquarters of Police
Radosław CHINALSKI

Document Updates

Version[5]	Date[6]	Updates and Revision History[7]	Author
20100604	04/06/2010	First draft	J. Derkacz
20100614	14/06/2010	Stable version	J. Derkacz
20100618	18/06/2010	Final version	J. Derkacz
20100619	19/06/2010	Final version with minor corrections	M. Leszczuk
20100727	27/07/2010	Secion 6 (Compliance of INDECT work with Ethical Rule), Annex 1 and Annex 2 were added	J. Derkacz
20100731	31/07/2010	Translations of letters	M. Leszczuk
20100817	17/08/2010	Final version	M. Leszczuk

[5] In form of "vYYYYMMDD"; Version number and edition should correspond to the actual document name conventions.
[6] In form of "DD/MM/YYYY"
[7] Attach as appendix document reviews when appropriate; describe also the current status of the document e.g. "released for internal review", "released for comments from partners"